

Summary Minutes
City of Sedona
Historic Preservation Commission Meeting
City Council Chambers, Sedona City Hall, Sedona, AZ
Monday, August 22, 2011 – 4:00 p.m.

1. Verification of notice, call to order, roll call and Pledge of Allegiance.

Chairman Unger verified the meeting had been properly noticed and called the meeting to order at 4:00 p.m.

Roll Call:

Commissioners: Chairman Brynn Unger, Vice Chairman Stephen Thomiszer and Commissioners Jane Grams, Helen Snyder and Noreen Wienges. Commissioners Michael Pierce and Charles Schudson were excused.

Staff: Kathy Levin and Donna Puckett

2. Public forum for items not on agenda. Limit of 3 minutes per presentation. (Note that the Commission may not discuss or make any decisions on any matter brought forward by a member of the public).

The Chairman opened the public forum and having no requests to speak, closed the public forum.

3. Commission and staff announcements and summary of current matters.

Kathy Levin announced that the Citizens Steering Committee for the Community Plan update is getting ready to host seven individual topical workshops in the months of September and October, and the second one to be held on September 21st at 6:00 p.m. is titled "*Building Community*". Within that topic, we will be discussing Arts & Culture, Historic Preservation and the kinds of things that enrich a town's sense of place. It could a discussion of plazas, gathering places, etc., so if you are available that would be great. She also included in your box a listing of all seven workshops:

- September 14th - Growth and Region
- September 21st - Building Community
- September 27th - Housing
- September 28th - Transportation
- October 5th - Economy & Prosperity
- October 12th - Sustainability
- October 18th - Parks & Recreation

Kathy explained that the workshop on October 18th will be facilitated by the consultant that is working with the Parks & Recreation Department to determine the needs of the community regarding parks and recreation.

Chairman Unger encouraged the Commissioners to attend, because they are really important, although the one on Building Community will probably be the most relevant.

4. Discussion/possible action regarding a request for a Certificate of Appropriateness for the following Historic Landmark property: Jordan Historical Park. The address is: 735 Jordan Road, Sedona, AZ 86336. The subject property is identified as: Assessor's Parcel Number (Coconino County): 401-03-001F. Applicant: City of Sedona, Case No.: CA11-02 (Historic Register Numbers 01, 02, and 03)

Chairman Unger presented a brief overview of the procedural steps for the Certificate of Appropriateness hearing and asked Kathy Levin to present the Staff Report.

Presentation, Kathy Levin: Indicated that this Certificate of Appropriateness proposes to install a life-size bronze sculpture of a cowboy by local artist Susan Kliewer, who is present, at the Jordan Historical Park adjacent to the Walter and Ruth Jordan house. The Jordan Historical Park is a local historic landmark and each of those buildings is locally landmarked. Also, the site is on the National Register of Historic Places and all of the buildings are named on the National Register. The Sedona Historical Society operates the museum under a Lease Agreement with the City; it is a 5-year Lease Agreement and it was executed on June 8, 2010. The property is located at 735 Jordan Road and it is approximately 3.7 acres in size.

A letter was received from the Red Rock Arts Council, who originally submitted the Letter of Intent and application for a Certificate of Appropriateness, and that was received before it was determined that the City, and not the leasee, should be the applicant for a city-owned property. In the past, the Sedona Historical Society has brought applications for Certificates of Appropriateness, but with this proposal and any others that follow, the City will stand as applicant. We did not initiate the solicitation or the donation of the sculpture; however, the City is acting as the applicant. Nevertheless, it is the Letter of Intent that she would like to draw your attention to. It expresses the desire of the Red Rock Arts Council to install an art sculpture *"that will celebrate the teaching of local history by pioneers in the form of a cowboy. This sculpture is intended to encourage and attract interaction and photo-taking opportunities with visitors to the park."*

Kathy indicated that she also wanted to read into the record the description that the artist wrote to describe the *Story Teller*, *"In the early days, when life in Sedona centered around farming and cattle, ranch hands would recite poetry and tell stories after a long day in the saddle. Cowboys would often show off a few rope tricks too. The bronze sculpture I will complete will stand about six feet tall and have a classic patina. His clothing, chaps, hat and boots will reflect that period in Sedona history. Later, sculptures of children will be cast. Seated on logs, they will be listening to the tales of the cowboy."*

Kathy explained that the proposed location for the sculpture is adjacent to the east-facing side of the Walter and Ruth Jordan house in a landscaped area that is reflected in the photographs that were submitted with the application, and in the area that you saw just prior to this meeting at your site visit. The Board of Trustees of the Sedona Historical Society, on June 14th, met and approved the acceptance of this sculpture, so it is the Commission's job today to review this application and determine if it is consistent with the sections in the Land Development Code and any references therein to the U.S. Department of Interior Standards.

Kathy indicated that she wanted to draw the Commission's attention to the first of these, the U.S. Department of Interior Standards state for new additions to a site, *"Introducing any new construction onto the building site, which is visually incompatible in terms of size, scale, design materials, colors and texture, which destroys historic relationships on the site or which damages or destroys important landscape features is not recommended."* Staff also conferred with State Architect, Bob Frankenberger of the State Historic Preservation Office, and this proposal will be reviewed not only by you, but the Parks & Recreation Commission, because it is a City park, and thereafter, it will go to the Art in Public Places Committee, which is affiliated with the Arts & Culture Commission, and then finally to the Arts & Culture Commission. Both in terms of the Department of Interior Standards and in our own Land Development Code, we address the issues of compatibility and consistency.

Staff feels that if we were only to take a very strict interpretation of that language, it might lead us to conclude that the bronze sculpture of a cowboy might not be compatible with nor relate to the Jordan buildings or the Jordan family history. It also might not complement the context of the landscape, including the remnants of the fruit orchards on the site; however, the proposed cowboy sculpture does reflect the broader mission of the Sedona Historical Society and the Sedona Heritage Museum, which is "to research, preserve and teach the history of the greater Sedona area", and while the museum is "focused on the period from 1876 to the present -- the lifestyles and works of people who pioneered this community, and on Sedona's first industry of raising apples and

peaches", it provides the context from which the Sedona Historical Society and the Museum outreaches to its constituents.

Kathy indicated that the sculpture would undoubtedly appeal to all of our visitors, both domestic and international, that want to learn more about the great southwest and the great cowboy legends that exist here. The sculpture would not adversely affect the listing on the National Register of Historic Places, and that is the reading she got from Bob Frankenberger at the State Historic Preservation Office. He and staff see this as not introducing new history to the site, but rather a storyteller. The sculpture as a storyteller will be potentially later enhanced with the addition of other complementary pieces that the application indicated would be children that could be seated in front of the bronze sculpture, so that might be phase two, which would complete the setting and imply and infer the storyteller component of this piece of art.

Kathy explained that the existing buildings also can still convey the significance of their own story and the integrity of the site is not lost, because there is no real adverse affect, so staff feels that possibly the very best thing that can happen in the Commission's review is to strike some compromise between not placing it on the site and finding the most appropriate setting for that, which would not detract from the historic buildings, would stand on its own merit as a piece of art perhaps in a different setting, and perhaps be at some distance from the existing historic buildings, and that is the question in her Staff Report that she left the Commission with, "Would it be better to distance it from the historic Jordan house and the other two buildings and locate it in another area of the park?"

Kathy pointed out that the Commission just had a site visit and was able to tour pretty much the whole area and looked at a couple of other areas that might be more suitable, and those can be included in the Commission's discussion.

Commission's Questions of Staff:

Commissioner Snyder asked if it is cast in concrete that the figures in the future will be children or potentially other cowboys, is it likely that the figures will be made, and do we have any timeframe as to when that would occur. What she saw simply said a log with children, but it didn't have any timeframe. Kathy indicated that it appears in two places; the first is in the Certificate of Appropriateness application and it references a sketch of the proposed sculpture and the planned sculpture location and all auxiliary pieces and those pieces are displayed in that sketch. There is another place, possibly in the Letter of Intent from the Red Rock Arts Council. The Commissioner repeated that there wasn't a timeframe given and Kathy indicated that she didn't recall a timeframe, but it was mentioned in at least two locations. Kathy referred to the sketch, but noted that it didn't show the addition. Kathy then pointed out that in the artist's description, she states that later, sculptures of children will be cast, seated on logs, and they will be listening to the tales of the cowboy, but we don't have any sense of timing. Vice Chairman Thomiszer asked if the artist would have a sense of timing and Kathy indicated that we could definitely ask.

Commissioner Snyder indicated that based on the conversation during the site visit, she heard that the children added value to the sculpture, because it clearly depicted it as a storyteller. Without the children, it wasn't as clear that the statue was a storyteller and the application seems to hinge on the fact or one of its assets is that it is a storyteller, so it becomes of interest as to when the pieces will be completed. Kathy indicated that maybe a descriptive plaque, if it is going to be phased in, could indicate that it would be a future installation.

Chairman Unger indicated that she knows the Sedona Historical Society is interested in having this for their benefit and certainly they are leasing the property, but is there any issue with the City in terms of having those pieces there or is that something that we don't need to address. Kathy indicated that the Commission has limited review, the Parks & Recreation Commission will see this a little differently as a City park, and they may look at installation costs or maintenance, etc. They won't be looking at it through the same lens that you do with respect to the historic nature of the

buildings and the site. The Arts & Culture Commission will look at accepting this as a piece of art in the City's collection.

Commissioner Snyder asked if there is any specification as to how close the sculpture will be to the house; the pictures are inconsistent and difficult to assess for the distance from the house to the piece. The line drawing seemed inconsistent with the photographs, so she wondered if there are any exact measurements. Kathy indicated no, she has a sketch and it wasn't necessarily drawn to scale, but Harriet McInnis of the Red Rock Arts Council is here today, so she might have a sharper idea of where that placement would be.

Commissioner Wienges asked about the reason for the location that was chosen as opposed to another location in the park or were other locations considered. Kathy explained that nothing in the application indicated that they evaluated other potential sites for the sculpture.

Vice Chairman Thomiszer asked who determined the location and Kathy explained that the Red Rock Arts Council approached the Sedona Historical Society about a potential donation to their site and she doesn't know what transpired in terms of site selection, but again, Harriet McInnis is present and can probably address that.

Public Comment:

The Chairman opened the public comment period at this time.

Harriet McInnis, President of the Red Rock Arts Council, Sedona, AZ: Indicated that they had a grass roots effort to raise funds for the Sedona Schnebly monument and Susan Kliever was the artist for that project. They had funds left over and waited for the appropriate time to see what site might be available for another art in public places project. It just happened that they were looking at two or three places and their preference was the Sedona Historical Society. A conversation began with Geri Jahnke, their Treasurer, and a volunteer at the Sedona Museum and also with Janeen Trevillyan, who is here today. They had several meetings with the Red Rock Arts Council Board Members to discuss this project and they thought the cowboy might be an appropriate figure to engage students or adults in the storytelling of the cowboy in that period of history, so that is some background as to how they got this started.

In terms of where the sculpture would go, it is their preference to put it by the Jordan House, but they don't have it cast in concrete that it needs to be there, if you feel there is a more appropriate site. She believes from the photograph, it appeared that the sculpture would be about 10 ft. to 15 ft. away from the wall of the house. Also, they thought that some stumps could be created and put around the monument until sculptures were available, and people who came to visit could sit on the stumps and maybe hear a speech by Michael Peach or some other presenter, so it gave a little venue for that kind of presentation.

Harriet explained that they don't know how much money they will have left at this stage, to determine how many pieces they can do beyond this sculpture. It may be that they can do none, but if they have any funds left over, they thought they could begin the process of fundraising between the Red Rock Arts Council and the Sedona Historical Society to raise funds for additional pieces during the nine months that it will take Susan to complete the piece. Fundraising is definitely going to be part of it; they have no timeframe for that at this point in time. A lot depends on the reaction to the piece at the Sedona Historical Museum when that is installed. They know that the Red Rock Arts Council wants to continue its efforts in public awareness of art in Sedona, so they are committed to helping with this process, and she thinks it is important that you see the piece, so she would like to turn this over to Susan Kliever, so she can show you what it looks like.

The Chairman asked if she had any questions of the Commission and Harriet indicated no, not at this time, but she does want to say that she thinks Sedona, as a southwest community, is attractive to people because of its heritage, and the cowboy is so much a part of that, that they didn't distinguish from farmers and other folk who existed at that period of time. They saw it as an

integral part of that period of history, so she hopes the Commission will give it the consideration that they did.

Commissioner Snyder indicated that it sounds like the position is not yet locked in, when she said 10 ft. to 15 ft.; that is quite a generous range, so it sounds as if they don't have the exact location yet.

Susan Kliewer Dolan, Artist, Elmerville, AZ: Displayed the maquette and explained that the rope he is holding to spin fell off, but he will have a rope in his hand like he is telling stories, poetry and he is also spinning a rope, which they usually did. Commissioner Wienges asked if the base is bronze and Susan indicated yes, which gives it a good stable base.

Vice Chairman Thomiszer asked if there is going to be some stone base to anchor it and Susan explained that it would be a concrete pad, with an I-bolt in the pad and a chain through it, so nobody can steal it; there are lots of ways to do it. The Vice Chairman suggested constructing a little red rock base, and then secure it that way. His concern is if kids start playing around it that it is secure. Susan explained that they try to do that with all of their monuments.

Susan indicated that she has been a citizen of Sedona since 1969 and when she moved here it was open range and cows often were herded down 89A; it really was a cowboy town, so it was a natural thing for her to want to make a cowboy. You have seen other sculptures she has done around town -- Sedona Schnebly, the Sinagua piece at Sinagua Plaza, and this Wednesday, they are dedicating a piece at the Sedona Medical Center, which a lot of nice ladies that were Cancer survivors helped her with. She has been really involved with the community and sculpture for quite a while, and she loves it, it is great, so it would be a real honor to get to do this piece for the town.

She added that she has alternate suggestions, if you feel the cowboy is really out of place. She has always wanted to do Walter Jordan with a shovel, and that could be another possibility, but she spent a lot of time in that house. Her kids played with the Jordan's grandkids, and she would go up there and visit with them, when she went to pick up her kids, so that whole area is special to her.

Vice Chairman Thomiszer indicated that the sculpture is brilliant, but it is important that the piece has the whole thing so he is telling a story. If we could see what is planned for the children, the benches should be large enough so people can interact with the sculpture and be under the storyteller. It is great, but it would be sensational if we could see the children there, because the whole concept of storytelling would come forth with those pieces. Susan pointed out that another way they can raise money for the children is to sell the maquettes and that is what they did when they did the Sedona Schnebly, and that is why they have money now, because they continue to sell. The cowboy is a good subject for people to take home with them after they leave Sedona.

Commissioner Snyder asked if the statue was designed after an actual photograph or imagined and Susan explained that she used a lot of the old photographs from the '20s and '30s that are in the book about Sedona that is sold at the Museum. He has the batwing chaps that they wore then and she tried to do it authentic to that period.

Vice Chairman Thomiszer asked if the children that she is envisioning also would be in 20s. . . Susan indicated yes, they would be farm kids in overalls and little dresses and real logs can be used; she wants to keep it rural and rustic.

Janeen Trevillyan, Sedona, AZ: Indicated that she realized that in the packet presented, there isn't a sketch of the story circle described and you haven't seen it, so she thought she would bring that up. When the Red Rock Arts Council came to the Historical Society and the Museum and described what they wanted to achieve, they were thinking that the historic-based storyteller fit the teaching mission of the Museum, so that is why it is a storyteller, plus the fact that Ruth Jordan wanted to preserve her home and places for teaching history. When that came up, then came the idea of a story circle, so the Museum and the Historical Society Board has made a commitment to

the Red Rock Arts Council that if they get through the hoops and go forward with this project, the Museum will take on trying to get some stumps there, so that story circle is there from day one; whether they can put a child in it on the first day or not, they are not sure. The second thing they have made a commitment to is that they can do interpretative signage that would be along the lines of either setting the stage and the fact that it is a photo opportunity, but there could also be a little rendition of what it would look like with a child or two and a couple of the sculptures there, and they might be able to sell the maquettes at the Museum, so the whole experience comes together and they could see how that works in the future. It is also possible in terms of timing and funding; it is their understanding that the City's entire public art budget is committed to the roundabout art, but they are in the same boat in that they don't have a final number yet, so depending on their final number, the City might have public art money, so next spring there might be that conversation, plus whatever the Red Rock Arts Council can bring and/or grant money, and new money will come into the City's public art fund over time, but granted the City needs to decide how they will spend that money, but it is an opportunity that the Red Rock Arts Council can avail itself to that has been discussed.

Geri Jahnke, Sedona, AZ: Indicated that she has lived in Sedona since 1980 and they had an art gallery, so she is in the art field as well. Also, she volunteers at the Museum and loves history, and one thing that caught her mind with the cowboy was the fact that Mrs. Jordan loved history and she when she sold the property to the City, she wanted to preserve the history of Sedona, not just their property, because she was into history. Cowboys have been here so long and are so indicative of the West. They get people visiting the Museum from all over the world -- Asia, Europe, Africa, etc., and they love the cowboy and the history of the cowboy, because this is a one of a kind place in the West for that, so they thought that could be appropriate. Mrs. Jordan had a wonderful leather cowgirl outfit and she wore it numerous times in her home and for special events, and her daughter Ruthie Jordan has her mother's cowgirl outfit, because they were the same size and she wears that to the museum for special events. It is a wonderful piece of history for the family too. The other speakers have really rounded out the afternoon of talking, so that is really all she has to say.

Having no other requests to speak, the Chairman closed the public comment period.

Summary Discussion:

Commissioner Wienges thanked the Red Rock Arts Council for bringing this project to the Commission and for funding it and thanked Susan Kliever for working on this. She knows the artist's work from other things she has done and her work is great. She would love to see this sculpture on the property. As far as the discussion about the storyteller, she thinks stumps to begin with would be fine until the money is raised for the children -- that establishes the feeling itself by having stumps and visiting children can sit there and get the feel of it, so that is a fine way to start it. She is also okay with the issue of it being a cowboy as opposed to Walter Jordan. It is fitting for that area and she is sure there were cowboys on that property telling stories, so that is fine with her.

Commissioner Wienges added that the only problem she has is with the actual location as proposed. Looking at the Department of Interior Standards, she looked at "is it visually compatible with the building" and she doesn't think it is visually compatible, standing there looking at the sculpture with the building immediately behind it. It is kind of jarring to her eyes. She wants to see the sculpture on that property, but just further away from the building.

Commissioner Grams indicated that she would echo everything that Commissioner Wienges said; she thinks it is wonderful, but she has a problem with the closeness to the building and the compatibility. With a 6 ft. large sculpture, the building height there to the roofline is probably no more than 7 ft., so that is her problem.

Chairman Unger indicated that she thinks the sculpture is fantastic and the building is fantastic, but putting them together doesn't do them justice. It would be better to place the sculpture farther from the building. We looked at several locations and there is one. The other thing is that we don't want to put it somewhere that it is not going to be seen, because that would be pointless, but on the

other hand, her feeling is, as the Historic Preservation Commission Chairman and as an artist, she sees that it would be better suited for another location. We looked at one that is just as you are walking up from the lower parking lot and approaching the building. There is a nice space there that is sitting right below the red rocks, so in terms of the photo opportunity, it would be incredible there, and in her personal opinion, if you are going to have somebody speaking to an audience that would be a better place for you to put it, because it is more open. You don't have the trees there that are really going to block a bigger audience from the driveway. If you want somebody to speak next to the sculpture, you will lose that. She wants it to have its own weight, and maybe a better weight for it would be there, and also for the building given the fact that it isn't quite the same subject matter relative to the people that lived there. The storytelling is, and she agrees with that and the fact that there were lots of cowboys here, but she would like to see it in a more separate location; however, that doesn't prevent her from accepting it as a sculpture on that site.

Vice Chairman Thomiszer indicated that he shares Chairman Unger's opinion. The sculpture is beautiful enough that it should have its own place to distinguish it and he likes the idea of having it positioned so the red rocks become the backdrop instead of a window pane and some green shingles, etc. as a backdrop for such a beautiful piece. Our opinion is that we like the sculpture and the idea of it being at the Jordan Historic Park, but the question is the placement, so do we suggest where we place it?

Kathy Levin explained that the Commission can do two things in a motion; the Commission can approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for the sculpture at Jordan Historical Park with a recommendation that it be sited in a specific location.

Commissioner Snyder indicated that she likes the cowboy motif, because they ran cattle through Sedona and she personally likes it better than Mr. Jordan, since that is less specific. She likes it at the site, but she is concerned about the proximity to the house with the maintenance of the building and the difficulty of doing anything to the building with the sculpture that close. It also looks more like a yard sculpture when it is put close to the house, which diminishes the artistic quality of the artwork. If it is placed further from the house, with the red rocks as a backdrop, the strength of his persona comes through more strongly, so she likes the location at the Park, but not the proposed location.

Commissioner Grams agreed and indicated that if it has its own location, it could become the story teller circle with its own identity and it enlarges the park and doesn't crowd such a wonderful piece of art. We can develop more of the park if it is in one of the areas we looked at.

MOTION: Vice Chairman Thomiszer moved to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for the Jordan Historical Park CA11-02 (Historic Register Numbers 01, 02, and 03) for the addition of a life-size sculpture of a bronze cowboy presented to us in the maquette today for a specific location that the HPC group saw and approved, and consistent with the Sedona Land Development Code, Article 15, §1509. Commissioner Grams seconded the motion.

Chairman Unger indicated that she thinks the motion needs to be a little more specific in terms of location and the Recording Secretary asked if there is clarification regarding the site the Commission saw and approved. Kathy Levin suggested actually specifying the location, i.e., such as its distance from the parking lot, etc. Vice Chairman Thomiszer indicated that the distance was on the north side of the access road going in, that accommodates handicap parking, and is along the walking trail from the lower level parking, and can be seen by the visitors coming from the lower level parking or people driving up the driveway, and it was the closest area, just before the trail.

Commissioner Snyder suggested being more precise and asked if "not adjacent to the house, but adjacent to the path, between the orchard and mesquite that borders the National Forest" would work. Chairman Unger indicated that she didn't know. Commissioner Snyder then restated her suggestion as, "not adjacent to the house, but adjacent to the roadway leading to the house, between the apple orchard and mesquite border to the National Forest". The Chairman asked if it

would be appropriate to say, ". . . not at the proposed site, but rather at a site. . . ." Commissioner Wienges suggested saying, "as an individual is walking on the trail from the parking lot and enters the access road, it is the first space on the right". Chairman Unger pointed out that the only thing that is there as an actual landmark is a large metal box and just beyond the large metal box, on the right-hand side facing the homestead is where we were thinking. It is at the top of the path from the parking lot, just beyond the large metal box on the right-hand side, and that is the only thing we can landmark, so would that satisfy everybody in terms of understanding where it is? Kathy Levin indicated yes, but asked if the Chairman is including not adjacent to the house, and the Chairman indicated yes, not adjacent to the house as it was in the proposal, but at this other location.

Commissioner Snyder indicated that there is only one clearing and Commissioner Grams added that to the far side of that were a couple of old wagon wheels. The Chairman agreed, but indicated those are mobile, Commissioner Grams indicated that area-wise, it could be a very large area to be developed. Vice Chairman Thomiszer added that if the Commission does this again, we should take a measuring device.

Commissioner Snyder indicated that the Commission could come up with some language that is pretty precise, if we say not adjacent to the house, in the clearing; however, the Chairman indicated that is why we have to have a landmark. The Commissioner stated that there is only one clearing. Kathy indicated that she asked Janeen Trevillyan and clarified for the Commission that the metal box is an old metal firebox. Commissioner Snyder then stated that it was the first clearing above the walking path from the overflow parking lot to be precise, and the other concern with the proposed location was that it wasn't handicap accessible with the little rock wall around it, so there would have to be some accommodations built.

REVISED MOTION: Vice Chairman Thomiszer moved to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for the Jordan Historical Park CA11-02 (Historic Register Numbers 01, 02, and 03) for the addition of a life-size bronze sculpture of a cowboy not to be located adjacent to the house as was proposed, but rather at the right side of the path from the parking lot just past the old metal firebox and before the wagon wheels, consistent with the Sedona Land Development Code, Article 15, §1509. Commissioner Wienges seconded the motion.

Commissioner Snyder indicated that the drawback in making it that precise is if there was any reason why they couldn't put it there, that would hurt our proposed motion. Chairman Unger indicated that she didn't think so and she wants to make sure that whatever place we are asking them to put it is really visible, and a lot of the other places wouldn't be as visible. We want this to be at the best possible location for photos, traffic coming in, etc., and saying that we definitely don't want it at the house is the other side of it.

Commissioner Snyder indicated that she agrees with not adjacent to the house; we could always put for example and list what you listed, in case there is any reason that would not be feasible for the weight of the structure, etc., then they could move it someplace close by. Chairman Unger explained that if we do that, we probably need to broaden where we don't want it too. If we say that it can't be in front of the house; we want it somewhere else, and then it ends up close to the house, we have shot ourselves in the foot.

Vice Chairman Thomiszer indicated that we are historic preservation and our job is to determine the historic preservation acceptability of the sculpture, and we are all in agreement that it works, but we feel it doesn't work next to the house. Chairman Unger agreed and indicated that is why we are saying it needs another place and we have specified a good place; she doesn't see that there is another place on the property that would be better. She worries about us putting it too close to the parking lot and she doesn't want it down there, because it disappears. If we put it closer to the house in any of those other three locations, they wouldn't be as beneficial to the sculpture itself and we would be getting closer to the house again. She understands what Commissioner Snyder is saying, but she doesn't think there will be any issues and if there are, it would be a no-brainer that it would have to be changed.

Vice Chairman Thomiszer indicated that staff stated that other Commissions will be reviewing it too and asked if they have the option of manipulating where it is located and Kathy Levin indicated yes. The Vice Chairman then indicated that HPC's opinion should be that historical preservation-wise, it works but not next to the house; any place, but not at that location. Chairman Unger indicated that we could change it and leave it there without a location, and that being said, we have a second for this motion and need to vote. If it doesn't pass, we have to revise it.

Commissioner Wienges commented that if there is a question about the structure or if something isn't right about the rocks, then another Commission will say it can't be done and there is the adjustment, so the motion is fine. Commissioner Snyder stated that it isn't our position to specify the exact location; we need to state that it not be adjacent to the house, which is the historic portion of the property, so she would be in favor of a less precise proposal.

Commissioner Grams agreed that maybe with all of these other Commissions, we should make it more general and that we don't like the proposed location, which is unfair to both the house and the sculpture. The sculpture is so marvelous, it deserves its own park area with all of the enhancements, and at that location, it is like the main entrance. People have parked and walked up, so it is the first thing they see -- now they see nothing but the orchard until they get to the house. If we could have a beautiful area built around this sculpture with a "Welcome to Jordan Park", it would be the first thing you see, so maybe we do that as a second recommendation, but not include it in the approval.

The Recording Secretary suggested that it might be possible for the standing motion to be cited as a preference, as the Commission's preferred location with it emphatic that you don't want it near the house, because one thought would be if they say it is 10 ft. to 15 ft. from the house wall now, what if they move it to 20 ft., are you happy? Chairman Unger agreed that is the other issue and she worries that we may back ourselves into the same thing again, but if we say no to this and yes to that, at least they have an idea of where we are, but if we call it a preference rather than a demand that works the best of all worlds, because that gives them an idea of what we are looking at, rather than just saying not here. The Recording Secretary indicated the motion should clearly state the Commission's concern about it being in close proximity to the house, but then the rest of the motion could be stated as your preferred location. Kathy Levin agreed and explained that if you send a motion to the next series of Commissions and Committee reviews without specifying a location and only saying not near the house, it doesn't give enough guidance.

The Chairman agreed that it doesn't give them an idea of what we are thinking, because basically all of the words we said here won't be heard by anybody else and if we want them to know what we are thinking, we need to have at least a stated preference. Commissioner Snyder indicated that she liked that suggestion; it is a very good suggestion.

The Chairman suggested saying, ". . . not to be located adjacent to the house as was proposed, but the Commission's preference for the site would be. . . ." Vice Chairman Thomiszer indicated that he was trying to clarify why the Commission doesn't want it close to the house, because of historic preservation considerations. Commissioner Wienges suggested saying in keeping with the U.S. Department of Interior Standards; however, Kathy Levin explained that if the Sedona Land Development Code section is referenced that is included.

SECOND REVISED MOTION: Vice Chairman Thomiszer moved to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for the Jordan Historical Park, CA11-02 (Historic Registration Numbers 01, 02, and 03) for the addition of a life-size bronze sculpture of a cowboy, not to be located adjacent to the house as was originally proposed, but the Commission's preference for the site would be at the right of the path from the parking lot just past the old metal firebox and before the wagon wheels, consistent with the Sedona Land Development Code, Article 15, §1509. Commissioner Wienges seconded the second revised motion. VOTE: Second Revised Motion carried five (5) for and zero (0) opposed. (Pierce and Schudson excused)

The Chairman recessed the meeting at 5:15 p.m. for photographs of the maquette and reconvened the meeting at 5:23 p.m., and at the Chairman's request, the Commission agreed to address agenda item 6 before agenda item 5.

6. Discussion/possible action and commissioner status reports on Arizona Centennial 2012 projects.

Kathy Levin indicated that logo was copyrighted and she sent a communication to all of the community-based organizations letting them know that it was available and could be used if they let her know for what purpose. She has heard from KSB, the Verde Valley Sinfonietta, the Sedona Historical Society, Sedona Arts Center and the Chamber of Commerce, all of which intend to use the logo that was created by the students, for promotion of their respective events and merchandise. Additionally, the quilt group got together in late July and the Red Rock News did a feature story and all of the quilters were there. It is done except for the backing and binding, and Commissioner Snyder recommended buying a quilt stand for some venues and the owner of the Quilter's Store is purchasing that and we will reimburse her and get a deep discount.

Kathy added that she was asked by the Mayor if the quilt could be used as the centerpiece of a display at the Arizona League of Cities and Towns, beginning next Monday, so we are going to try to get that together and get something written about it, so it can be used. Ostensibly, we were going to have its debut at the joint meeting with Council on September 12th, so it will get a different debut with the League of Arizona Cities and Towns and all of the elected officials, etc., but he specifically asked for the quilt. Chairman Unger indicated that she, Commissioner Snyder and Kathy need to get together and discuss a brochure on it, now that it is complete.

Kathy indicated that she has had two meetings with Beth Lazoni of the Sedona Historical Society and she has prepared a proposal to offer a self-drive and ticketed van tour for a Centennial Tour of Sites and Buildings in April or May of 2012, and at the last meeting, a local tour company that had expressed prior interest was present and Beth asked for some quotations from that tour company. The Museum has worked with another provider and has an established relationship with another van company, so they will look at that company to also provide a cost estimate. By September, we should have a Letter of Agreement between the City and the Sedona Historical Society; we have been asked to define our roles and responsibilities and in their proposal they have stated what they would like or not like from the City. She will be sending a copy of the grant that was funded to underwrite the Centennial Tour to Beth, so she can see the line items used. Not only is the Museum interested in perhaps a one-time event, but they will perhaps look at this as an every other year fundraising event based on its success, which would be great. The best scenario in her mind is that a community-based organization that has a good volunteer base and is committed to telling history authentically finds it as a good opportunity for fundraising, after they have had a year of experience. We are meeting again on September 8th.

Commissioner Snyder asked when the debut is scheduled and Kathy repeated next Monday, in Phoenix at the Annual League of Arizona Cities and Towns. Chairman Unger indicated that something to think about is that she wanted the Commission to see the pictures of a huge quilt at Mayo that is mounted, and it is a nice set-up with a Plexiglas box. The quilt is mounted on a hardboard and the hardboard is mounted on sort of a canvas backdrop, and then the Plexiglas is screwed around it and it is really presented well and it saves it.

Commissioner Wienges reported that she received the art supplies and she has been trying to interview as many centenarians as possible. She has met with four of them -- three at Sedona Winds Assisted Living and one at Cottonwood Village. She has four more -- two at Sedona Winds Independent Living that she hopes to see this week and two more, a husband and wife both 100-years-old in their own home; however, the daughter is against them being interviewed, but she is trying to get the message to the daughter that possibly they could participate in the art portion. She also will be meeting with the Verde Valley Caregivers, because they may have others on their list.

Commissioner Wienges then explained that the direction of the project is not going as she had expected, because not everybody can remember or express themselves to give any oral history, so she is collecting whatever information she can get and taking photos, but they aren't very good, so she is nixing the idea of putting photos in the paper, plus she is finding that the Red Rock News has already done that for most of these people as they reached 100, so she doubts the newspaper will be interested. She is really left with the art project; she has an artist working with her, Rachel Lombardi, and we have one canvas that we ask each centenarian to add some brush strokes to, but some of them can't hold the brush, so we talk to them and find out what color and what shape they would like, and then Rachel does it for them, so it is going to be very abstract work that all of them have contributed to. The canvas is 14 in. x 18 in., so we will have one finished work that she hopes to have framed and a plaque with all of the centenarians' names, and we hope to hang it in a City building with a presentation, so they are all recognized and remembered. The canvas is called "*Circle of Life*". After the first few people we met with, we came up with circular shapes and Rachel looked at it and said "*Circle of Life*", and then her husband looked at it without knowing and said that we should call it "*Circle of Life*".

Vice Chairman Thomiszer suggested that their children might be very resourceful in these interviews and Commissioner Wienges explained that a number of them have included children. Two of the people interviewed at Sedona Winds are in the Serenity Unit, so they suggested that she set-up an interview with a daughter who was very helpful. She had actually written a book on her mother that had the whole family history and she talked with the daughter of another one on the phone, so the children have been involved as much as possible. The other two ladies have no living children. Vice Chairman Thomiszer pointed out that he would think that the children could provide some good history too.

Commissioner Snyder indicated that she heard from the Sedona Arts Center that they aren't planning for the timeframe that we are interested in yet, but when they get their planning done later this fall, she will get back to the Commissioner. She has calendared events through April of 2012 and she is holding May open for the schools, since that is likely to be the month they want or in August, but they also aren't planning yet and will get back to her. Chairman Unger suggested that she might want to talk with Kathy Levin about getting the quilt to the upcoming event. Commissioner Snyder asked where the quilt is and Kathy Levin indicated that Maggie Castillo-Cockrum has it. As soon as she received the request, she sent a note to Lorrie Petersen, Karin Scanlon and Patsy Kittredge, plus Patsy at the Quilter's Store, and Karin told her that Maggie has it and that we could probably get this figured out.

Commissioner Snyder then indicated that she purchased a couple of extra papers with the article, in case Kathy wanted one and Lorrie had requested a couple also. Kathy Levin indicated that she would like to use that with the display, if the Commissioner can bring that in tomorrow. Commissioner Snyder indicated that she could give Kathy one, and Chairman Unger added that she also bought an extra one.

Chairman Unger indicated that she met with the Chamber of Commerce and the City and she gave a presentation on all of the things that we are doing. Joe McNeill was there and he is thinking of doing a movie event in June and wanting it on our calendar, and he would like to have it made a state-recognized event.

The Chairman opened the public comment period at this time.

Janeen Trevillyan, Sedona Historical Society, Sedona, AZ: Indicated that she sent in the idea of a proclamation and the Commission will follow-up on that, so they won't duplicate that effort. Also, they added an activity to honor the Thompson's at the parade and she will be contacting Commissioner Schudson, because they now have their plans for their temporary exhibit for 2012, and they would like to include some political satire, etc., and then that part of it can be considered some sort of co-op project. They also got some Centennial merchandise in the gift shop at the Museum if anyone is looking for them. It isn't getting pushed very well by the state, but they have a

few souvenir items and will start gearing up their promotion of that and their activities in the newsletter that will come out in a couple of weeks. The Yavapai County Centennial Committee is working on a flagstone plaque program, where they are putting some legacy plaques around the County to tell the history, and everyone around the County can submit a proposal to get a free plaque that is shaped like the State of Arizona. The Historical Society was successful in being a recipient of one of the six plaques, so they will be working to place that and the plaque will be at the Red Rock Cemetery out on the Loop Road just outside of the City limits; it is the oldest cemetery for Sedona and Oak Creek Canyon.

Additionally, there are several people doing centennial books and the first is the Yavapai County Centennial Committee that is doing an historic photo book of images of Yavapai County and that is coming out in about two weeks. It will debut at the Arizona Best Fest in Prescott on September 17 - 18. The County Committee is buying several hundred books to resell at cost to resellers like the historical societies, etc., so they will have some and will work with the City if some are wanted. Another gentleman in the Verde Valley is doing a similar book called Images of the Verde Valley and there are quite a number of Sedona images in that and it will come out December 5th, then Lisa Schnebly Heidinger, great-granddaughter of Sedona Schnebly, is doing the official centennial book by the Arizona Commission and it will come out in October. Other than that, they are just doing the small steps necessary for the events and starting to get the publicity out, etc.

Commissioner Snyder asked why the plaque wouldn't be put where Sedona is and Janeen Trevillyan explained that they own both historic cemeteries and it is not commemorating Sedona Schnebly; it is commemorating area history, so they are placing it at the oldest location and as long as it is in the County that is all the County cares about.

5. Discussion/possible action on joint meeting with City Council on September 12, 2012.

Chairman Unger indicated that the Commission's next meeting is with the City Council at our regular meeting time in the Vulture and asked if we want a PowerPoint for the meeting. Kathy Levin indicated that has been a good template to showcase what we have done and it enables each member to participate. Last year, we had 8 to 10 slides and we might want to cover the same things:

- Work Plan Highlights -- looking both behind and ahead
- Small Grant Program
- HP Month - a pass for us this year, because of the Centennial planning
- Newest Historical Landmark - Owenby Ditch
- Centennial Planning

Kathy then indicated that we can use the same format; it was succinct and did a good job of putting all of the information you might talk to in a slide, and you can always embellish something on the Centennial. Typically we are asked what more we want to be doing and we should give that some thought; you might want to practice saying nothing or no, but that is your choice. Centennial was a big thing to bite off and you are doing it extremely well for a Commission that only meets once a month with seven members. As you may recall, the Mayor really was strong on having an historic tour, so we can show that we invited all of the community-based organizations and tour companies to a meeting last May and out of that we started talking with the Sedona Historical Society, and she is confident that they will deliver and we will have had a third meeting with them before the joint meeting, so we should be close to being able to discuss that in some detail. It wasn't only to celebrate our historic resources; the Mayor sees this as another economic opportunity for the community, so he has been very pro event/activity and, through the Council, supportive of other entities and the Chamber.

Chairman Unger indicated that she will put the PowerPoint together and get it to Kathy Levin for review, and then Kathy will get in touch with each Commissioner and propose a part that each can take, and you can tell Kathy if there is something that you would rather do. She and Kathy will try to

get together on the PowerPoint next week and email it to the Commissioners, so you can get back with Kathy.

Kathy Levin indicated that the draft can be burned to a disk and after having seen that, the Commissioners can suggest what they would want to speak to. Everyone will speak to the Centennial given, your respective responsibilities, but we can put your name next to the other ones. We won't have a dress rehearsal, because you always do well.

Commissioner Wienges mentioned that she had calendared that we might be meeting early on the 12th; however, Kathy explained that is what happened today; it will start at 4:00 p.m. Commissioners Snyder and Grams indicated that they will not be present on the 12th and Kathy indicated that hopefully we will have five Commissioners present.

7. Discussion/possible action regarding future meeting dates and future agenda items.

Vice Chairman Thomiszer asked about the 8th and Chairman Unger indicated that is with the tour companies. Kathy Levin added that it is at 9:00 a.m. in Community Development.

Chairman Unger noted that Commissioner Snyder's term may be expiring in November, so she may want to look at that, since she would have to reapply. Commissioner Snyder indicated that she didn't think it was that soon; she is up for renewal on the Housing Commission this October. Kathy indicated that she will check that and the Chairman explained that she thought she saw that on the Directory of Terms of Office.

The Chairman then stated that the next meeting is September 12th and we will meet in the Vultee with the City Council. Kathy Levin requested that the Commissioners wear their name tags.

8. Adjournment.

The Chairman called for adjournment at 5:54 p.m., without objection.

I certify that the above is a true and correct summary of the meeting of the Historic Preservation Commission held August 22, 2011.

Donna A. S. Puckett, *Recording Secretary*

Date